

**AMERICAN TRANSMISSION COMPANY ACCESS INITIATIVE - DECISION MATRIX**  
**(Modified 11/18/04)**  
**Economic Comparison**

annual carrying charge %

9%

Scenario	Measure	Weighting %	Economic Component	Base Case + two fixes	Byron N. Madison (Illinois)	Salem N. Madison (Iowa)	Prairie Isl Columbia (Minnesota)	Luddington Forest Junction (Michigan)	Sault Ste. Marie Arnold (Canada)
Base Case	\$Millions per year	70%	Annual Capital Carrying Charge (\$M)	2.7	12.9	20.1	22	29.9	23.6
			Market Savings - 2012 (\$M)	6.9	37.1	33.6	8.5	-13.3	-4
			Loss Cost Savings - 2012 (\$M)	-0.5	4.0	4.1	-0.271	0	0.361
			<b>Savings Ratio</b>	<b>2.4</b>	<b>3.2</b>	<b>1.9</b>	<b>0.4</b>	<b>-0.4</b>	<b>-0.2</b>
				<b>8</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>
High Wind	\$Millions per year	10%	Annual Capital Carrying Charge (\$M)	2.7	12.9	20.1			
			Market Savings - 2012 (\$M)	17.1	27.0	27.4			
			Loss Cost Savings - 2012 (\$M)	0.2	3.7	5.0			
			<b>Savings Ratio</b>	<b>6.4</b>	<b>2.4</b>	<b>1.6</b>			
				<b>10</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>3</b>			
High Internal Generation	\$Millions per year	10%	Annual Capital Carrying Charge (\$M)	2.7	12.9	20.1			
			Market Savings - 2012 (\$M)	9.7	21.3	17.5			
			Loss Cost Savings - 2012 (\$M)	-0.3	1.2	2.0			
			<b>Savings Ratio</b>	<b>3.5</b>	<b>1.7</b>	<b>1.0</b>			
				<b>10</b>	<b>5</b>	<b>3</b>			
Low Internal Generation	\$Millions per year	10%	Annual Capital Carrying Charge (\$M)	2.7	12.9	20.1			
			Market Savings - 2012 (\$M)	25.0	65.7	61.7			
			Loss Cost Savings - 2012 (\$M)	-0.3	2.3	2.9			
			<b>Savings Ratio</b>	<b>9.1</b>	<b>5.3</b>	<b>3.2</b>			
				<b>10</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>4</b>			
100%			<b>Economic Score</b>	<b>8.6</b>	<b>8.5</b>	<b>5.2</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>	<b>0</b>

**Savings Ratio = (Market Savings + Loss Cost Savings) / Annual Carrying Charge**